

# **Protocol Development for the Standardization of Identification and Examination of UBC Bodies Along the U.S.-Mexico Border: A Best Practices Manual**

**Binational Migration Institute  
University of Arizona  
Tucson, Arizona**

**2014**

This project was supported by Grant No.: 2010DDBX0716 awarded by the Bureau of Justice Assistance. The Bureau of Justice Assistance is a component of the Office of Justice Programs, which also includes the Bureau of Justice Statistics; the National Institute of Justice; the Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention; the Office for Victims of Crime; and the Office for Sex Offender Sentencing, Monitoring, Apprehending, Registering and Tracking. Points of view or opinions in this document are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official position or policies of the U.S. Department of Justice.

**Legal Disclaimer:** The legal information in this manual is general. Laws change frequently and vary from state to state. Therefore, this manual is not intended as a substitute for identifying current legal responsibilities. The Binational Migration Institute accepts no responsibility for those who rely on this manual as a substitute for identifying legal responsibilities.



Raquel Rubio-Goldsmith, CoPI

Anna Ochoa O'Leary, Co-PI

Gabriella Soto, Graduate Research Assistant

Bruce Parks, MD, Consultant

**Student Research Assistants in chronological order of their participation:**

Francisco Baires, Anthropology

Kathryn Rodriguez, Business and Public Administration

Soni Stake, Public Health

Oscar Hernando Torres-Urquidi, Agriculture

Azucena Sanchez, Communications

Reina Garcia, Texas State University - San Marcos

Luis Eduardo Torrens, Public Health

Jenna Glickman, International Studies, Honors College

Robin Reineke, Anthropology

Sofia Gomez, Public Health

Gabriella Soto, Anthropology

Aungelique Rodriguez, Journalism

Zoraida Francis-Reyes, Latin American Studies

Brenda Anaya, Environmental Studies, Honors College

Zachary Driscoll, Latin American Studies

Megan Sheehan, Anthropology

Florence Durney, Anthropology

Jesus Jaime-Diaz, Education

## Table of Contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	vi
<b>Section 1: Protocol Development for the Standardization of Post Mortem Examination and Identification of UBC bodies along the U.S.-Mexico Border: A Best Practices Manual</b> .....	2
<b>Section 2: Discovery of Remains and Evidence Collection</b> .....	9
<b>Section 3: Transportation</b> .....	16
<b>Section 4: Pathology Exams</b> .....	18
<b>Section 5: Identified, Unidentified, and Missing Migrants</b> .....	30
<b>Section 6: Release</b> .....	37
<b>Section 7: DNA</b> .....	43
<b>Section 8: Databases</b> .....	47
<b>Section 9: Burial and Exhumation</b> .....	53
<b>Section 10: Death Recording</b> .....	57
<b>Section 11: Records and Record Keeping</b> .....	63
<b>Works Cited</b> .....	67
<b>Appendices</b>	
Appendix A: <i>Methods</i> .....	70
Appendix B: <i>Social Vulnerability Index</i> .....	75
Appendix C: <i>Excerpt from “The Identification of Unknown Undocumented Border Crossers (UBCs): Recommendations for the Improvement of Current Methods” (Woods 2007)</i> .....	82
Appendix D: <i>Resources</i> .....	84
Appendix E: <i>County Data Collected by BMI</i> .....	85
Appendix F: <i>Common Abbreviations</i> .....	89

## List of Figures

<b>Figure 1:</b> Best Practice Flowchart for UBC Deaths.....	1
<b>Figure 2:</b> Best Practice Infographic.....	5
<b>Figure 3:</b> Are GPS Coordinates Recorded at the Scene of Discovery?.....	10
<b>Figure 4:</b> Is Cause of Death Ever Determined at the Scene of Discovery?.....	11
<b>Figure 5:</b> First Contact when Human Remains are Discovered in a Wilderness Setting.....	12
<b>Figure 6:</b> Are Identification Cards Ever Used Unilaterally to Establish Positive Identification?.....	19
<b>Figure 7:</b> Methods Used to Identify Unknown Remains.....	22
<b>Figure 8:</b> Supplementary Autopsy Forms from PCOME.....	25-26
<b>Figure 9:</b> Remains Identification Flowchart.....	30
<b>Figure 10:</b> Officials Authorized to Establish Positive Identification on Unidentified Remains.....	32
<b>Figure 11:</b> Stages of Identification Flowchart.....	36
<b>Figure 12:</b> Release Protocol for Unknown Persons from the Pima County Office of the Medical Examiner.....	42
<b>Figure 13:</b> Was Lack of Funding Cited to Justify Practices?.....	44
<b>Figure 14:</b> Who Pays for DNA Samples?.....	45
<b>Figure 15:</b> U.S. Standard Certificate of Death.....	59
<b>Figure 16:</b> Supplementary Autopsy Forms from the Pima County Office of the Medical Examiner, with UBC notation highlighted.....	60
<b>Figure 17:</b> Percent of Time Officials Reported Multiple Agencies Involved.....	64
<b>Figure 18:</b> Percent of Time Counties with Multiple Respondents Gave Conflicting Answers .....	70
<b>Figure 19:</b> Types of Officials Interviewed Pie Chart.....	72
<b>Figure 20:</b> Counties in Study Area.....	74
<b>Figure 21:</b> Social Vulnerability Metrics, As Applied to UBC Deaths.....	77
<b>Figure 22:</b> Social Vulnerability Index.....	78
<b>Figure 23:</b> Normalized General Fund Budget.....	79
<b>Figure 24:</b> Normalized County Percent Share of State Hospitals.....	79
<b>Figure 25:</b> Normalized Population Density.....	80
<b>Figure 26:</b> Normalized Percent of Population (over 24) with Bachelor’s Degree.....	80
<b>Figure 27:</b> Normalized Percent of Population Living Below the Poverty Line.....	81
<b>Figure 28:</b> Normalized Percent Population of Hispanic Descent.....	81

## Acknowledgements

This manual is the product of the sustained efforts of many. Meriting acknowledgement is the role of concerned citizens who organized their communities or through their offices, prompting actions that evolved into broader public concern over the growing number of deceased undocumented border crossers along the nation's southern border. Credited for drawing attention of this phenomenon to governments and civic leaders are those who were committed from early on to exposing the issues that this manual has strived to address, including the "how many have died," and "how many" remain unidentified. Among these are the Coalición de Derechos Humanos, in Tucson, Arizona, which was among the first of such organizations to take on the task of systematically compiling records from numerous sources to more accurately enumerate the deceased along the Sonoran desert migrant corridor. The work of human rights activists Isabel Garcia and Kathryn Rodriguez was instrumental to enjoining efforts led by the Pima County Medical Examiner's office, and in particular by Dr. Bruce Parks, Dr. Bruce Anderson, Dr. Greg Hess, and Robin Reineke, and the Pima County Board of Supervisors. This model of civic-scientific cooperation led to one of the first comprehensive reports on migrant deaths, and this multi-pronged model of collaboration has been the cornerstone for the applied research that engendered the idea for this manual.

The manual was subsequently made possible with the support from the Department of Justice/Bureau of Justice Administration [Congressionally directed project No. 2010 DD BX 0716]. We also thank Rep. Raúl Grijalva whose commitment to public service facilitated our work, for which The Binational Migration Institute (BMI) is grateful. We also wish to also acknowledge the institutional support given by the University of Arizona, for the assistance provided by the Office of Federal Relations, the Dean for the UA College of Social and Behavioral Sciences, J.P. Jones, and to the Department of Mexican American Studies, for the support each of these have provided. Within the Mexican American Studies Department, we are thankful for the assistance and encouragement given to BMI by its leadership: to Richard Ruiz, Department Head, and Antonio Estrada, former head of the Department, and for the support from staff member Chelsea Halstead. BMI is especially thankful for the assistance given by department administrator, Jose Garcia, for providing invaluable guidance and direction in navigating budgetary and bureaucratic matters.

A special thank you is also in order for the many research assistants who, while at the University of Arizona, joined BMI to help bring this project to completion, many of whom received their degree in the process and moved on to develop their professional and academic careers elsewhere: Brenda Anaya, Francisco Baires, Zachary Driscoll, Florence Durney, Zoraida Francis-Reyes, Reina Garcia, Jenna Glickman, Sofia Gomez, Jesus Jaime-Diaz, Robin Reineke, Aungelique Rodriguez, Megan Sheehan, Soni Stake, Luis Eduardo Torrens, and Oscar Hernando Torres-Urquidy. Gabriella Soto has our special appreciation for her long hours and dedication in helping to prepare the final draft of this manual.

Finally, the manual would not have been possible without the time taken by public officials and medico-legal practitioners to provide information to BMI researchers. In the midst of carrying out their many duties and tasks, they patiently answered our questions, shared insights, and communicated their challenges and frustrations with the research team, allowing us to gain greater understanding of complexities and multifaceted nature of this nation's border region.

BMI is also grateful to the network of medical examiners, officials, and representatives of community groups for the time they gave to advise us, review the manual's content, and to provide researchers with specialized knowledge and critical feedback from a national and international perspective. Among this group of specialists were:

- Eddie Canales, South Texas Human Rights Center
- Mercedes Doretti, Argentine Forensic Anthropology Team
- Arthur Eisenberg, Center for Human Identification at University of North Texas
- Julio Estrada, San Diego County Medical Examiner's Office
- Lt. Thomas Garcia, Imperial County Sheriff's Office
- Harrell Gill-King, Institute of Forensic Anthropology at University of North Texas
- Pat Goldsmith, Department of Sociology at Texas A&M
- Rick Ortiz, Nueces County Medical Examiner's Office
- Raymond Pettit, Argentine Forensic Anthropology Team
- Raúl Ramirez, Brooks County Judge
- Nestor Rodriguez, Department of Sociology at University of Texas - Austin
- Mary Romero, School of Justice Studies at Arizona State University
- Kate Spradley, Forensic Anthropology Center at Texas State University - San Marcos
- Corinne Stern, Webb County Office of the Medical Examiner

Finally, and most importantly, we deeply appreciate the ground-breaking efforts by Dr. Bruce Parks, former Chief Medical Examiner of Pima County, and his colleagues, Dr. Bruce Anderson and Dr. Gregory Hess (current Chief Medical Examiner). Developing a model that exemplifies the highest professional standards, promoting the dignity of the dead and compassion for families, this team provides other border communities with a clear path to how postmortem investigations can help families and policy-makers. We thank them for their continuing support and guidance.